Check for updates

G OPEN ACCESS

Citation: Tengera O, Nyirazinyoye L, Meharry P, Rutayisire R, Rulisa S, Haile ZT (2023) Factors associated with receipt of adequate antenatal care among women in Rwanda: A secondary analysis of the 2019–20 Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey. PLoS ONE 18(4): e0284718. https://doi. org/10.1371/journal.pone.0284718

Editor: Gulzhanat Aimagambetova, Nazarbayev University School of Medicine, KAZAKHSTAN

Received: July 12, 2022

Accepted: April 5, 2023

Published: April 20, 2023

Peer Review History: PLOS recognizes the benefits of transparency in the peer review process; therefore, we enable the publication of all of the content of peer review and author responses alongside final, published articles. The editorial history of this article is available here: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0284718

Copyright: This is an open access article, free of all copyright, and may be freely reproduced, distributed, transmitted, modified, built upon, or otherwise used by anyone for any lawful purpose. The work is made available under the <u>Creative</u> Commons CC0 public domain dedication.

Data Availability Statement: Because this is a secondary data analysis of the RDHS, data are owned by a third-party organization it is not

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Factors associated with receipt of adequate antenatal care among women in Rwanda: A secondary analysis of the 2019–20 Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey

Olive Tengera^{1*}, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye¹, Pamela Meharry^{1,2}, Reverien Rutayisire¹, Stephen Rulisa¹, Zelalem T. Haile³

 College of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Rwanda, Kigali, Rwanda, 2 Department of Human Development Nursing Science, University of Illinois Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, United States of America,
Department of Social Medicine, Ohio University Heritage College of Osteopathic Medicine, Dublin, Ohio, United States of America

* tengera.olive@gmail.com

Abstract

Background

Every year, antenatal care (ANC) remains a life-saving health intervention for millions of pregnant women worldwide. Yet, many pregnant women do not receive adequate ANC, particularly in sub-Saharan Africa. The study aimed to determine the factors associated with the receipt of adequate ANC among pregnant women in Rwanda.

Methods

A cross-sectional study was conducted using the 2019–2020 Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey data. The study included women aged 15–49 years who had a live birth in the previous five years (n = 6,309). Descriptive statistics and multivariable logistic regression analyses were performed.

Results

Overall, 27.6% of participants received adequate ANC. The odds of receiving adequate ANC were higher among those in the middle household wealth index (AOR 1.24; 1.04, 1.48) and rich index (AOR 1.37; 1.16, 1.61) compared to those in the poor wealth index category. Similarly, having health insurance was positively associated with receiving adequate ANC (AOR 1.33; 1.10, 1.60). The odds of receiving adequate ANC were lower among urban dwellers compared to rural (AOR 0.74; 0.61, 0.91); for women who wanted pregnancy later (AOR 0.60; 0.52, 0.69) or never wanted pregnancy (AOR 0.67; 0.55, 0.82) compared to those who wanted pregnancy; for women who perceived distance to a health facility as a big problem (AOR 0.82; 0.70, 0.96) compared to those that did not; and for women whose ANC was provided by nurses and midwives (AOR 0.63; 0.47, 0.8), or auxiliary midwives (AOR 0.19; 0.04, 0.82) compared to those who received ANC from doctors.

permissible to share with the public. However, the data is publicly available with permission from the MEASURE DHS Data Archive at ICF International and obtained upon request via the following link www.measuredhsprogram.com. The authors confirm they did not have any special access privileges to the data.

Funding: The author(s) received no specific funding for this work.

Competing interests: The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

Conclusion

The prevalence of women who receive adequate ANC remains low in Rwanda. Effective interventions to increase access and utilization of adequate ANC are urgently needed to further improve the country's maternal and child health outcomes.

Introduction

Maternal and neonatal mortality are two of the most significant inequities in healthcare today. In 2017, 86% of global maternal deaths occurred in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) and Asia, with the former region accounting for two-thirds of mortality [1]. Similarly, SSA has the highest neonatal mortality rate, accounting for 43% of global newborn deaths [2]. Maternal and neonatal outcomes could be significantly improved with adequate antenatal care (ANC) by skilled providers throughout pregnancy [3–5].

Adequate ANC is defined based on the timing of the visit, frequency of visits, and receipt of components of care provided at each ANC contact [6]. The World Health Organization (WHO) 2016 guidelines recommend that all pregnant women receive early and regular quality care, which includes eight ANC contacts, double the number of the previously recommended four ANC-focused visits [6]. The first contact should be in the first trimester of pregnancy (at 12 weeks), and subsequently, two contacts in the second trimester (at 20 and 26 weeks) and five contacts in the third trimester (at 30, 34, 36, 38, and 40 weeks) [7]. The goal of ANC is to identify risk factors and chronic threats, establish baseline health status, and monitor and evaluate women and their fetuses regularly to prevent and avoid complications during pregnancy [8]. During ANC provision, pregnant women learn about healthy behaviors, disease prevention, and social, emotional, and psychological support from skilled health care providers (HCP) at a critical time of their life [6].

A review of Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) and Multiple Indicator Cluster Surveys (MICS) conducted in 54 low- and middle-income countries (LMIC) [9] reported that women in the Central and Southern Asia regions had the highest prevalence of timely initiation of ANC, and women in the Caribbean and Latin America were most likely to reach eight or more ANC contacts. The review also reported that 44.3% initiated ANC in the first trimester, 49.9% had one or more ANC visits, and only 11.3% had eight visits [9]. Women that received more ANC content had about five times higher odds of attending four or eight ANC contacts (P<0.001) [9]. Women less likely to achieve adequate ANC included poor, single, lower-educated, rural dwellers, larger households, with lower birth intervals, higher parity, and non-health facility birth [9]. A South African study reported that lack of information, poor quality or insufficient health services, and cultural beliefs and practices also affected adequate ANC [10].

Access to adequate ANC is essential for HCP to intervene with potentially life-saving management. Most deaths are preventable if detected and treated early by a skilled HCP, which may reduce maternal morbidity and mortality by 20% [4]. Another consideration is the liveborn infant with a deceased mother; a Nigerian survey showed that only about a third of mother-less infants survived beyond five years of age [11]; therefore, maternal survival is vital for child survival.

In Rwanda, ANC coverage with a skilled HCP has increased to about 99% of women [12], though ANC utilization (attending at least four visits) was only 47.6% [5], and distance to health facilities remains a barrier [13]. The WHO introduced the eight-contacts model in

2016, and Rwanda is planning to implement this model soon [3, 12]. This paper aimed to determine the factors associated with receiving adequate ANC services among pregnant women in Rwanda. We hypothesized that the receipt of adequate ANC would be independently associated with sociodemographic and access to care-related factors.

Materials and methods

Study design and setting

This is a secondary data analysis of the 2019–2020 Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey (RDHS). The 2019–20 RDHS is a cross-sectional survey [5] conducted in collaboration with the National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda (NISR), the Ministry of Health, and the DHS Program of ICF International.

In brief, a two-stage stratified random sampling method was used to select participants. The first stage involved selecting sample points (clusters) or enumeration areas (EAs) delineated for the 2012 Rwanda Population and Housing Census (RPHC), which involved 500 selected clusters, 112 in urban areas and 388 in rural areas. There were 14,675 women aged 15–49 years eligible for the individual interview in selected households. Nearly all women were interviewed for the RDHS (n = 14,634), resulting in a response rate of 99.7 percent. Detailed information about sampling and data collection methodology is available elsewhere [5].

The sampling frame for the current study included women aged 15–49 years who had a live birth within the five years preceding the 2019–20 RDHS (n = 6,302) data collection. We excluded women with missing data on ANC visits for the most recent live birth (n = 142) and other variables in the current study (n = 121). The final sample for the analysis comprised 6,039 women.

Study variables

The outcome of interest was the receipt of adequate ANC, which was constructed by first creating an index based on responses to three questions 1) the total number of ANC visits, 2) the timing of the first ANC visit, and 3) components of ANC received. In the 2019–20 RDHS. Women who reported having a live birth in the past five years were asked to report on the total number of ANC visits, the number of months pregnant at the time of the first ANC visit, and components of ANC received during their ANC visits. The number of visits was coded as none to three, and at least four. The Rwanda Ministry of Health (MoH) ANC guidelines [12] state that the timing of the first visit should be within the first three months of pregnancy. This variable was coded as yes or no and defined as the first ANC visit within the first three months of pregnancy. Components of ANC were defined based on four ANC components reported in the 2019–20 RDHS [5] and included urine sample test, blood sample test, blood pressure measurement, and mid-upper arm circumference measurement. Then a dichotomous variable for receipt of adequate ANC was created and coded as 1 (yes) and 0 (no) if respondents had received at least 4 ANC visits, had the first visit within three months of pregnancy, and had received all four components of ANC. It was coded as 1 and 0 otherwise.

Based on the RDHS final report and existing literature, the following variables were selected: age (15–24, 25–34, 35–44, 45 years and above), marital status (never married, married/living together, and divorced/separated/widowed), education (none, primary, and secondary or higher), household wealth index (poor, middle, rich), employment (no, yes), health insurance (no, yes), residence (rural, urban), pregnancy intention (wanted then, wanted later, wanted no more), distance to nearest health care facility (big problem, not a big problem), birth order (1st, 2nd, 3rd, 4th child and above) and ANC provider (doctor, nurse or midwife, auxiliary midwife).

Ethics approval

This study was a secondary analysis of RDHS 2019–20 which was registered and approved by the University of Rwanda College of Medicine and Health Sciences Institutional Review Board (CMHS/IRB/212/2021). The authors received a permission letter to access the database from the Measure DHS archive at ICF Institutional Review Board. Verbal informed consent was obtained before the interviews in the original population-based survey and reported in the aggregate format. Data are available to the general public by request in different formats from the Measure DHS website [www.measuredhsprogram.com].

Statistical analysis

Categorical variables were presented as frequencies and proportions. The Rao-Scott chi-square test was used to compare differences in the receipt of adequate ANC by each factor. The factors included age, marital status, education, household wealth index, health insurance, distance, place of residence, employment, pregnancy intention, birth order, and type of ANC provider. All factors were entered simultaneously into the regression model regardless of statistical significance in the bivariate analysis. A multivariable-adjusted logistic regression was used to determine the independent association between each factor and receipt of adequate ANC. Odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence interval (CI) were presented. A p < 0.05 was considered statistically significant. Complex sample design elements were applied for all analyses, including stratification, clustering, and sample weights. All analyses were performed using SAS OnDemand for Academics (SAS Institute Inc., Cary, NC).

Results

Table 1 presents the characteristics of the study sample. The majority, 3949 (48.8), were aged between 25 and 34 years. The majority, 4896 (81.2%), were married, and 3928 (64.6%) had a primary education level. The poor constituted the highest proportion of the household wealth index, 2583 (41.7%), and almost a quarter, 1463 (24.4%), were unemployed, and 1066 (18%) did not have health insurance. Over half of the women, 3550 (58.4%), intended to get pregnant, and 2750 (34.0%) had a birth order of the 4th child or above. The majority, 4739 (82.2%), lived in a rural area, and 4652 (76.8%) perceived the distance to a health facility as a big problem. Only 1691 (27.6%) received adequate ANC; most providers were nurses or midwives, 5727 (95.0%).

Table 2 shows the results of the Rao-Scott chi-square test used to compare differences in the receipt of adequate ANC by each factor. Adequacy of ANC received significantly differed by the women's age ($X^2 = 9.54$, df = 3, p = 0.023), marital status ($X^2 = 10.48$, df = 2, p = 0.005), education ($X^2 = 27.21$, df = 2, p < 0.001), household wealth index ($X^2 = 36.81$, df = 2, p < .001), health insurance ($X^2 = 23.09$, df = 1, p < 0.001), pregnancy intention ($X^2 = 85.88$, df = 2, p < 0.001), birth order ($X^2 = 22.32$, df = 3, p < 0.001), distance to a health facility ($X^2 = 13.62$, df = 1, p = 0.002) and the presence of a skilled provider at the ANC visit ($X^2 = 26.18$, df = 2, p < 0.001).

Table 3 shows the crude odds ratio (COR) and multivariable-adjusted odds ratio (AOR) between the women's characteristics and receipt of adequate ANC. In the AOR, household wealth index, health insurance, residence, pregnancy intention, distance to the health facility, and ANC provider were significantly associated with the receipt of adequate ANC. Women from a middle and rich wealth indexes had higher odds of receiving adequate ANC (AOR = 1.24: CI = 1.04–1.48; p = 0.018) and (AOR = 1.37: CI = 1.16–1.61; p<0.001) respectively, compared to women from poor household wealth index. Compared to those without health insurance, women with insurance were more likely to receive adequate ANC (AOR

	Overall n (wt. %)	
Age group (years)		
15-24	1247 (15.9)	
25-34	3949 (48.8)	
35-44	2652 (32.8)	
45 and above	204 (2.5)	
Marital status		
Never married	636 (10.1)	
Married/living together	4896 (81.2)	
Divorced/separated/widowed	507 (8.7)	
Education		
No education	637 (10.7)	
Primary	3928 (64.6)	
Secondary and higher	1474 (24.7)	
Household wealth index		
Poor	2583 (41.7)	
Middle	1151 (19.5)	
Rich	2305 (38.8)	
Employment		
No	1463 (24.4)	
Yes	4576 (75.6)	
Health insurance		
No	1066 (18.0)	
Yes	4973 (82.0)	
Place of residence		
Rural	4739 (82.2)	
Urban	1300 (17.8)	
Intention to pregnancy		
Wanted then	3550 (58.4)	
Wanted later	1692 (28.2)	
No more	797 (13.3)	
Birth order		
1 st	2049 (25.3)	
2 nd	1821 (22.5)	
3 rd	1472 (18.2)	
4th and above	2750 (34.0)	
Distance to health facility		
Big problem	4652 (76.8)	
Not a Big problem	1387 (23.2)	
Adequacy of ANC received		
Inadequate	4348 (72.4)	
Adequate	1691 (27.6)	
ANC provider		
Doctor	291 (4.6)	
Nurse or midwife	5727 (95.0)	
Auxiliary nurse	21 (0.3)	
· · · · · ·		

Table 1. Demographic characteristics of the respondents (n = 6039).

Abbreviations Wt.%: Weighted percent

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0284718.t001

Table 2. Characteristics of the study sample by adequacy of ANC received (n = 6039).

		Adequ	acy of ANC received		
		Inadequate	Adequate	X^2 (df)	Р
		n (Wt. %)	n (Wt. %)		
Age group (ye	ears)			9.54 (3)	0.023
	15–24	772 (73.8)	273 (26.2)		
	25-34	2002 (70.5)	866 (29.5)		
	35-44	1447 (74.1)	512 (25.9)		
	45 and above	126 (76.4)	40 (23.6)		
Marital status	5			10.48 (2)	0.005
	Never married	487 (77.3)	149 (22.7)		
	Married/living together	3479 (71.4)	1417 (28.6)		
	Divorced/separated/widowed	382 (75.5)	125 (24.5)		
Education				27.21 (2)	<.001
	No education	489 (76.1)	148 (23.9)		
	Primary	2888 (74.1)	1040 (25.9)		
	Secondary and higher	971 (66.3)	503 (33.7)		
Household wealth index				36.81 (2)	<.001
	Poor	1985 (76.8)	598 (23.2)		
	Middle	823 (71.7)	328 (28.3)		
	Rich	1540 (68.0)	765 (32.0)		
Employed	1			0.03 (1)	0.867
	No	1043 (72.2)	420 (27.8)		
	Yes	3305 (72.4)	1271 (27.6)		
Health insurance				23.09 (1)	<.001
	No	844 (79.3)	222 (20.7)		
	Yes	3504 (70.9)	1469 (29.1)		
Place of residence				0.28 (1)	0.599
	Rural	3445 (72.6)	1294 (27.4)		
	Urban	903 (71.5)	397 (28.5)		
Pregnancy int	tention			85.88 (2)	<.001
	Wanted then	2440 (67.8)	1150 (32.2)		
	Wanted later	1311 (78.3)	381 (21.7)		
	No more	637 (79.9)	160 (20.1)		
Birth order				22.32 (3)	<.001
	1 st	1031 (71.2)	426 (28.8)		
	2 nd	952 (69.4)	434 (30.6)		
	3 rd	792 (70.1)	337 (29.9)		
	4 th and above	1572 (76.4)	494 (23.6)		
Distance to he	ealth facility			13.62 (1)	0.002
	Big problem	3290 (71.1)	1362 (28.9)		
	Not a big problem	1058 (76.7)	329 (23.3)		
ANC provide	r			26.18 (2)	<.001
	Doctor	177 (57.7)	114 (42.3)		
	Nurse or midwife	4153 (73.0)	1574 (27.0)		
	Auxiliary nurse	18 (88.6)	3 (11.4)		
	· ·		le de la construcción de la constru	1	1

Abbreviations Wt.%: Weighted percent; X^2 : Rao Scott chi-square; df: degrees of freedom

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0284718.t002

Characteristics		Unadjus	ted		Adjusted	
		OR (95%	CI)	Р	OR (95%CI)	Р
Age group (years)			,			
15-24			Reference		Reference	
25-34		1.18 (1.02, 1.37)		0.025	1.06 (0.90, 1.26)	0.470
35-44		0.99 (0.82, 1.19)		0.903	1.00 (0.79, 1.27)	0.998
45 and above		0.87 (0.58, 1.33)		0.528	0.97 (0.61, 1.54)	0.890
Marital status						
Never married			Reference		Reference	
Married/living together		1.37 (1.12, 1.67)		0.003	1.07 (0.84, 1.36)	0.584
Divorced/separated/widow		1.11 (0.81, 1.51)		0.522	1.00 (0.71, 1.40)	0.978
Education						
No education			Reference		Reference	
Primary		1.12 (0.91, 1.38)		0.304	0.97 (0.79, 1.19)	0.801
Secondary and higher		1.63 (1.27, 2.09)		0.002	1.21 (0.93, 1.59)	0.147
Household wealth index						
Poor			Reference		Reference	
Middle		1.31 (1.10, 1.56)		0.003	1.24 (1.04, 1.48)	0.018
Rich		1.56 (1.34, 1.81)		< .001	1.37 (1.16, 1.61)	< .001
Employed						
No			Reference		Reference	
Yes		0.99 (0.84, 1.16)		0.866	1.01 (0.86, 1.18)	0.955
Health insurance						
No			Reference		Reference	
Yes		1.57 (1.30, 1.89)		< .001	1.33 (1.10, 1.60)	0.004
Place of residence						
Rural			Reference		Reference	
Urban		1.05 (0.87, 1.27)		0.596	0.74 (0.61, 0.91)	0.004
Intention of pregnancy						
Wanted then			Reference		Reference	
Wanted later		0.58 (0.51, 0.67)		< .001	0.60 (0.52, 0.69)	< .001
No more		0.53 (0.44, 0.65)		< .001	0.67 (0.55, 0.82)	< .001
Birth order						
lst			Reference		Reference	
2nd		1.09 (0.92, 1.30)		0.328	1.12 (0.92, 1.37)	0.251
3rd		1.06 (0.88, 1.27)		0.563	1.14 (0.91, 1.43)	0.258
4 th and above		0.76 (0.64, 0.91)		0.003	0.94 (0.74, 1.21)	0.646
Distance to health facility						
Not a big problem			Reference		Reference	
Big problem		0.75 (0.64, 0.88)		0.003	0.82 (0.70, 0.96)	0.013
ANC provider						
Doctor			Reference		Reference	
Nurse or midwife		0.50 (0.37, 0.68)		< .001	0.63 (0.47, 0.85)	0.003
Auxiliary nurse		0.18 (0.04, 0.75)		0.019	0.19 (0.04, 0.82)	0.026

Table 3. Factors associated with receipt of adequate ANC (n = 6039).

Abbreviations: OR: Odds Ratio; CI: Confidence Interval

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0284718.t003

1.33: CI = 1.10, 1.60; p = 0.004), and urban women were less likely to receive adequate ANC as compared to rural women (AOR 0.74: CI = 0.61, 0.91; p = 0.004). Compared to women who wanted the current pregnancy, the odds of having adequate ANC were significantly lower for women who wanted a child later (AOR 0.60: CI = 0.52, 0.69; p = 0.001) and those who never wanted a pregnancy (AOR 0.67: CI = 0.55, 0.82; p<0.001). Women who perceived distance to a health facility as a big problem had lower odds of receiving adequate ANC than those who perceived distance to a health facility as not a big problem (AOR 0.82: CI = 0.70, 0.96; p = 0.013). Compared to women whose ANC was provided by doctors, the odds of receiving adequate ANC were lower for women whose ANC was provided by nurses or midwives (AOR 0.63: CI = 0.47, 0.85; p = 0.003), and auxiliary nurses (AOR 0.19: CI = 0.04, 0.82; p = 0.026).

Discussion

Adequate ANC services increase the possibility of a good pregnancy outcome, yet only 27.62% of women in this secondary analysis of the most recent RDHS received adequate care. It appears that nearly three-quarters of the women faced a challenge accessing ANC in the first three months of pregnancy, attending four visits, and receiving four of the identified ANC components. Studies from high-income countries also disclosed issues related to inadequate ANC and its association with adverse pregnancy outcomes in Canada [14] and France [15]. The high proportion of inadequate ANC in many countries contrasts with WHO recommendations [6].

Findings from the bivariate analysis between adequate ANC receipt and sociodemographic factors showed similarities with other studies. Women were more likely to receive adequate ANC when older (25 to 34 years) than younger women [16]. This finding likely signifies that as the mother's age increases, so does her knowledge, understanding, and experiences of pregnancy and related complications [17, 18]. The benefit of secondary or higher education rather than lower education [19–21] could relate to increased awareness of health services, pregnancy complications, and health-seeking behavior [19]. Being married would likely render partner support and awareness of the ANC benefit to both the mother and child, whereas single mothers would likely lack support [13, 21, 22]. Belonging to the rich and middle-class wealth index rather than the poor index was related to receiving adequate ANC [4, 23–25], with the latter being less likely to have health insurance and delayed access to ANC [26–28].

Other findings from the bivariate analysis between adequate ANC and obstetrical history, and distance to the ANC site revealed further similarities with other studies. Women with unplanned pregnancies were significantly associated with inadequate ANC [29–31], indicating women may keep quiet in fear of frustration or facing stigma with yet another pregnancy. Higher birth order was negatively associated with receiving adequate ANC [31–33] and this finding is regrettable considering that multiparous women are at higher risk of pregnancy and childbirth-related complications such as hypertensive disorders, placenta praevia, and postpartum hemorrhage [32]. Women who felt it was a big problem to reach the health facility were more likely to receive inadequate ANC services [33, 34], possibly due to higher costs and travel time to the health center, especially for mothers with other children.

In Rwanda, most ANC services are provided by nurses and midwives (92.9%) at the primary healthcare level, namely health centers and health posts [12]. The findings revealed that the type of ANC health care providers were significantly associated with women receiving inadequate ANC, and this could be related to the higher acuity attending these primary care services and staff shortages in the rural areas, as in Uganda [34]. In addition, women may receive a delayed referral of serious cases or conflicting information while attending rural ANC services, as in two studies in Rwanda [35, 36]. Other factors exacerbating this situation may include a lack of equipment and supplies, as reported in a recent systematic review by Dahab et al. on the barriers to accessing maternal care in eight African low-income countries [37]. Our findings reveal that more work needs to be done to assist nurses and midwives in meeting their patients' needs and for the country to meet the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) by 2030.

In the multivariate logistic regression analysis, variables such as age, marital status, education, and birth order lose their significance compared to bivariate analysis. Being employed or unemployed was not significantly associated with receiving adequate ANC. Conversely, being employed did increase the odds of early initiation of ANC according to a SSA systematic review by Okedo–Alex et al. [26]. Surprisingly, the place of residence was not significant in the bivariate model, but became statistically associated with adequate ANC receipt in the multivariate logistic model, similar to a DHS by Tessema et al. and a multi-country study in SSA by Tekelab et al. [38, 39]. Women living in urban areas may receive adequate ANC due to having many opportunities to access health facilities, in addition to higher educational levels and more knowledge of pregnancy and childbirth risks and danger signs [40].

Since this study was a secondary analysis of a national survey, it would be valuable to explore a deeper understanding of the women's perceptions and beliefs about adherence to adequate ANC through interviews or focus groups. It would also be interesting to research if a first-trimester ultrasound would make a difference to pregnant women coming in earlier for an ANC visit. In high-income countries, prenatal screening in the first trimester is performed for women of advanced maternal age to assess the fetus for Down's syndrome and trisomy 13, 18, and 21 [41]. Furthermore, a study is needed on the HCPs' perspectives of ANC standards, as well as the barriers and enablers to providing the WHO 2016 recommended ANC services.

Strengths and limitations of the study

The study represented women of childbearing age with an adequate sample size that could be generalized to similar settings. This secondary analysis was conducted using data from responses that were collected within the last three years, and therefore findings from this study helps in identifying the factors associated with ANC. Accordingly, it may help health care system to identify the interventions and implement them to improve ANC in the study area. As with other secondary analyses and cross-sectional surveys, the findings only show a snapshot of a person one time; there is a potential for recall bias, and we could not explore other factors related to adequate ANC found in primary studies.

Conclusion

The current study showed that only about a quarter of the pregnant women surveyed in the most recent DHS received adequate ANC in Rwanda. The women's wealth index, health insurance, residence location, pregnancy intention, distance to a health center, and ANC provider were associated with the receipt of adequate ANC. There is an urgent need for interventions to increase ANC utilization in Rwanda to meet the SDG, starting with the factors identified in this study.

Acknowledgments

We greatly acknowledge the Measure DHS program granting access to the 2019–20 Rwanda Demographic Health Survey data sets.

Author Contributions

- **Conceptualization:** Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Stephen Rulisa, Zelalem T. Haile.
- **Data curation:** Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Reverien Rutayisire, Zelalem T. Haile.
- **Formal analysis:** Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Reverien Rutayisire, Zelalem T. Haile.

Investigation: Olive Tengera.

Methodology: Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Zelalem T. Haile.

Project administration: Olive Tengera.

- **Visualization:** Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Stephen Rulisa, Zelalem T. Haile.
- Writing original draft: Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Stephen Rulisa, Zelalem T. Haile.
- Writing review & editing: Olive Tengera, Laetitia Nyirazinyoye, Pamela Meharry, Reverien Rutayisire, Stephen Rulisa, Zelalem T. Haile.

References

- World Health Organization. Maternal mortality evidence brief. Matern Mortal [Internet]. 2019;(1):1–4. Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/329886/WHO-RHR-19.20-eng.pdf? ua=1.
- 2. World Health Organization. Newborn Mortality 28. 2022. Available from: https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/levels-and-trends-in-child-mortality-report-2021.
- 3. Lattof SR, Moran AC, Kidula N, Moller AB, Jayathilaka CA, Diaz T, et al. Implementation of the new WHO antenatal care model for a positive pregnancy experience: A monitoring framework. BMJ Glob Heal. 2020; 5(6):1–11. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2020-002605 PMID: 32565442
- Gebrekirstos LG, Wube TB, Gebremedhin MH, Lake EA. Magnitude and determinants of adequate antenatal care service utilization among mothers in Southern Ethiopia. PLoS One [Internet]. 2021; 16 (7):1–19. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0251477 PMID: 34228728
- National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda, Rwanda Ministry of Health, ICF. Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey 2019–20 Final Report. [Internet]. Kigali, Rwanda; 2019. Available from: <u>https://</u> dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/PR124.pdf.
- World Health Organization. WHO recommendations on antenatal care for a positive pregnancy experience: Summary highlights and key messages from the World Health Organization's 2016 Global Recommendations for Routine Antenatal Care. Web page [Internet]. 2018; 10(1):1–10. Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/259947/WHO-RHR-18.02-eng.pdf;jsessionid= D02B4F6C6FC3299F00AD6CA510B1D0E5?sequence=1.
- World Health Organization. WHO recommendations on antenatal care for a positive pregnancy experience [Internet]. Geneva; 2016. Available from: <u>https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/</u> 250796/97892415?sequence=1.
- Mugo NS, Mya KS, Raynes-Greenow C. Country compliance with WHO-recommended antenatal care guidelines: Equity analysis of the 2015–2016 Demography and Health Survey in Myanmar. BMJ Glob Heal. 2020; 5(12). https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2019-002169 PMID: 33298468
- 9. Jiwani SS, Amouzou A, Carvajal-Aguirre L, Chou D, Keita Y, Moran AC, et al. Timing and number of antenatal care contacts in low-and middle-income countries: Analysis in the Countdown to 2030 priority countries. J Glob Health. 2020; 10(1). https://doi.org/10.7189/jogh.10.010502 PMID: 32257157
- Drigo L, Luvhengo M, Lebese RT, Makhado L. Attitudes of pregnant women towards antenatal care services provided in primary health care facilities of Mbombela Municipality, Mpumalanga Province, South Africa. Open Public Health J. 2020; 13(1):569–75.

- Obed JY, Agida ET, Mairiga AG. Survival of infants and children born to women who died from pregnancy and labour related complications. Nigerian Journal of Clinical Practice. 2007 Sep 14; 10(1):35– 40. PMID: 17668713
- National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda, Rwanda Ministry of Health, ICF. Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey 2015 Final Report. [Internet]. Kigali, Rwanda; 2015. Available from: https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR316/FR316.pdf.
- Nisingizwe MP, Tuyisenge G, Hategeka C, Karim ME. Are perceived barriers to accessing health care associated with inadequate antenatal care visits among women of reproductive age in Rwanda? BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2020; 20(1):1–10. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-020-2775-8 PMID: 32041559
- 14. Heaman MI, Martens PJ, Brownell MD, Chartier MJ, Derksen SA, Helewa ME. The association of inadequate and intensive prenatal care with maternal, fetal, and infant outcomes: A population-based study in Manitoba, Canada. Journal of Obstetrics and Gynaecology Canada. 2019 Jul 1; 41(7):947–59.
- **15.** Andegiorgish AK, Elhoumed M, Qi Q, Zhu Z, Zeng L. Determinants of antenatal care use in nine sub-Saharan African countries: A statistical analysis of cross-sectional data from Demographic and Health Surveys. BMJ Open. 2022; 12(2):1–13.
- Raru TB, Ayana GM, Zakaria HF, Merga BT. Association of higher educational attainment on antenatal care utilization among pregnant women in East Africa using Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) from 2010 to 2018: A multilevel analysis. Int J Womens Health. 2022: 2 (1): 67–77. <u>https://doi.org/10.</u> 2147/IJWH.S350510 PMID: 35140524
- Rwabufigiri BN, Mukamurigo J, Thomson DR, Hedt-Gautier BL, Semasaka JP. Factors associated with postnatal care utilisation in Rwanda: A secondary analysis of 2010 Demographic and Health Survey data. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2016; 16:1–8.
- Noh JW, Kim YM, Lee LJ, Akram N, Shahid F, Kwon YD, et al. Factors associated with the use of antenatal care in Sindh Province, Pakistan: A population-based study. PloS One. 2019 3; 14(4):e0213987. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0213987 PMID: 30943243
- McHenga M, Burger R, Von Fintel D. Examining the impact of WHO's Focused Antenatal Care policy on early access, underutilisation and quality of antenatal care services in Malawi: A retrospective study. BMC Health Serv Res. 2019; 19(1):1–14.
- Omer K, Afi NJ, Baba MD, Adamu M, Malami SA, Oyo-Ita A, et al. Seeking evidence to support efforts to increase use of antenatal care: A cross-sectional study in two states of Nigeria. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2014; 14(1):1–0. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-014-0380-4 PMID: 25410003
- Njiku F, Wella HL, Sariah A, Protas J. Prevalence and factors associated with late antenatal care visit among pregnant women in Lushoto, Tanzania. Tanzan J Health Res. 2017; 19(3):1–6.
- Hitimana R, Lindholm L, Krantz G, Nzayirambaho M, Condo J, Sengoma JPS, et al. Health-related quality of life determinants among Rwandan women after delivery: Does antenatal care utilization matter? A cross-sectional study. J Heal Popul Nutr. 2018; 37(1):1–10. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41043-018-0142-4 PMID: 29703248
- Tadele A, Teka B. Adequacy of prenatal care services and associated factors in Southern Ethiopia. Arch Public Heal. 2021; 79(1):1–8. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13690-021-00614-3 PMID: 34099020
- 24. Berde AS, Uner S. Adequacy of prenatal care received by Nigerian women and some related factors. TAF Preventive Medicine Bulletin. 2016:1; 15(3).
- Manzi A, Munyaneza F, Mujawase F, Banamwana L, Sayinzoga F, Thomson DR, et al. Assessing predictors of delayed antenatal care visits in Rwanda: A secondary analysis of Rwanda Demographic and Health Survey 2010. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2014; 14(1):1–8. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2393-14-290 PMID: 25163525
- Okedo-Alex IN, Akamike IC, Ezeanosike OB, Uneke CJ. Determinants of antenatal care utilisation in sub-Saharan Africa: A systematic review. BMJ Open. 2019; 9(10). https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2019-031890 PMID: 31594900
- Ayalew TW, Nigatu AM. Focused antenatal care utilization and associated factors in Debre Tabor Town, Northwest Ethiopia, 2017. BMC Research Notes. 2018; 11(1):1–6.
- Pell C, Meñaca A, Were F, Afrah NA, Chatio S, Manda-Taylor L, et al. Factors affecting antenatal care attendance: Results from qualitative studies in Ghana, Kenya and Malawi. PLoS One. 2013; 8(1). https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0053747 PMID: 23335973
- Mkandawire P, Atari O, Kangmennaang J, Arku G, Luginaah I, Etowa J. Pregnancy intention and gestational age at first antenatal care (ANC) visit in Rwanda. Midwifery. 2019; 68:30–8. https://doi.org/10. 1016/j.midw.2018.08.017 PMID: 30343263
- Mamuye Azanaw M, Gebremariam AD, Teshome Dagnaw F, Yisak H, Atikilt G, Minuye B, et al. Factors associated with numbers of antenatal care visits in rural Ethiopia. Journal of Multidisciplinary Healthcare. 2021; 10:1403–11. https://doi.org/10.2147/JMDH.S308802 PMID: 34140778

- **31.** Hajizadeh S, Ramezani Tehrani F, Simbar M, Farzadfar F. Factors influencing the use of prenatal care: A systematic review. Journal of Midwifery and Reproductive Health. 2016: 1; 4(1):544–57.
- Khan NR, Parveen S, Begum Z, Qayyum R, Malik R. Grand multiparity and maternal outcome in absence of adequate antenatal care. Journal of Postgraduate Medical Institute. 2017:13; 31(1).
- **33.** Manzi A. Antenatal care: Predictors of delays and effectiveness of targeted mentorship and quality improvement intervention at rural health centers in Rwanda (Doctoral dissertation, University of Rwanda). Available from:http://dr.ur.ac.rw/handle/123456789/780.
- 34. Anastasi E, Borchert M, Campbell OM, Sondorp E, Kaducu F, Hill O, et al. Losing women along the path to safe motherhood: Why is there such a gap between women's use of antenatal care and skilled birth attendance? A mixed methods study in Northern Uganda. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth. 2015; 15(1):1–5. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12884-015-0695-9 PMID: 26538084
- **35.** Rurangirwa AA, Mogren I, Ntaganira J, Govender K, Krantz G. Quality of antenatal care services in Rwanda: Assessing practices of health care providers. BMC Health Serv Res. 2018; 18(1):1–10.
- 36. Anatole M, Magge H, Redditt V, Karamaga A, Niyonzima S, Drobac P, et al. Nurse mentorship to improve the quality of health care delivery in rural Rwanda. Nursing Outlook. 2013:1; 61(3):137–44. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.outlook.2012.10.003 PMID: 23164530
- Dahab R, Sakellariou D. Barriers to accessing maternal care in low-income countries in Africa: A systematic review. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2020; 17(12):4292. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph17124292 PMID: 32560132
- **38.** Tessema ZT, Teshale AB, Tesema GA, Tamirat KS. Determinants of completing recommended antenatal care utilization in sub-Saharan from 2006 to 2018: Evidence from 36 countries using Demographic and Health Surveys. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2021; 21(1):1–12.
- Tekelab T, Chojenta C, Smith R, Loxton D. Factors affecting utilization of antenatal care in Ethiopia: A systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS One. 2019; 14(4):1–24. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0214848</u> PMID: 30973889
- 40. Yaya S, Bishwajit G, Ekholuenetale M, Shah V, Kadio B, Udenigwe O. Timing and adequate attendance of antenatal care visits among women in Ethiopia. PLoS One. 2017; 12(9):1–16. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0184934</u> PMID: 28922383
- Padula F, Laganà AS, Vitale SG, D'Emidio L, Coco C, Giannarelli D, et al. The introduction of the absolute risk for the detection of fetal aneuploidies in the first-trimester screening. The Journal of Maternal-Fetal & Neonatal Medicine. 2017 May 19; 30(10):1249–53. https://doi.org/10.1080/14767058.2016. 1210123 PMID: 27442264