

# G OPEN ACCESS

**Citation:** Yang L, Jin J, Luo W, Gan Y, Chen B, Li W (2020) Risk factors for predicting mortality of COVID-19 patients: A systematic review and metaanalysis. PLoS ONE 15(11): e0243124. https://doi. org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124

Editor: Raffaele Serra, University Magna Graecia of Catanzaro, ITALY

Received: September 25, 2020

Accepted: November 17, 2020

Published: November 30, 2020

**Peer Review History:** PLOS recognizes the benefits of transparency in the peer review process; therefore, we enable the publication of all of the content of peer review and author responses alongside final, published articles. The editorial history of this article is available here: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124

**Copyright:** © 2020 Yang et al. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Data Availability Statement: All relevant data are within the manuscript and its Supporting Information files.

**Funding:** This work was supported by National Nature Science Foundation of China [grant

**RESEARCH ARTICLE** 

# Risk factors for predicting mortality of COVID-19 patients: A systematic review and metaanalysis

#### Lan Yang<sup>®</sup>, Jing Jin<sup>®</sup>, Wenxin Luo, Yuncui Gan, Bojiang Chen<sup>‡</sup>\*, Weimin Li<sup>‡</sup>\*

Department of Respiratory and Critical Care Medicine, West China Medical School/West China Hospital, Sichuan University, Chengdu, Sichuan, China

These authors contributed equally to this work.

‡ These authors also contributed equally to this work.

\* weimi003@yahoo.com (WL); Cjhcbj@gmail.com (BC)

# Abstract

# Background

Early and accurate prognosis prediction of the patients was urgently warranted due to the widespread popularity of COVID-19. We performed a meta-analysis aimed at comprehensively summarizing the clinical characteristics and laboratory abnormalities correlated with increased risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients.

#### Methods

PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science, and Embase were systematically searched for studies considering the relationship between COVID-19 and mortality up to 4 June 2020. Data were extracted including clinical characteristics and laboratory examination.

## Results

Thirty-one studies involving 9407 COVID-19 patients were included. Dyspnea (OR = 4.52, 95%CI [3.15, 6.48], P < 0.001), chest tightness (OR = 2.50, 95%CI [1.78, 3.52], P<0.001), hemoptysis (OR = 2.00, 95%CI [1.02, 3.93], P = 0.045), expectoration (OR = 1.52, 95%CI [1.17, 1.97], P = 0.002) and fatigue (OR = 1.27, 95%CI [1.09, 1.48], P = 0.003) were significantly related to increased risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients. Furthermore, increased pretreatment absolute leukocyte count (OR = 11.11, 95%CI [6.85, 18.03], P<0.001) and decreased pretreatment absolute lymphocyte count (OR = 9.83, 95%CI [6.72, 14.38], P<0.001) were also associated with increased mortality of COVID-19. We also compared the mean value of them between survivors and non-survivors, and found that non-survivors showed significantly raise in pretreatment absolute leukocyte count (WMD:  $3.27 \times 10^9/L$ , 95%CI [2.34, 4.21], P<0.001) and reduction in pretreatment absolute lymphocyte count (WMD =  $-0.39 \times 10^9/L$ , 95%CI [-0.46, -0.33], P<0.001) compared with survivors. The results of pretreatment lactate dehydrogenase (LDH), procalcitonin (PCT), D-Dimer and ferritin showed the similar trend with pretreatment absolute leukocyte count.

numbers 91859203 and 81871890] and Major Science and Technology Innovation Project of Chengdu City [grant number 2020-YF08-00080-GX].

**Competing interests:** The authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

Abbreviations: COVID-19, coronavirus disease 2019; SARS-CoV-2, severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2; IQR, interquartile range; SARS, severe acute respiratory syndrome; CI, confidence interval; LDH, lactate dehydrogenase; PCT, procalcitonin.

#### Conclusions

Among the common symptoms of COVID-19 infections, fatigue, expectoration, hemoptysis, dyspnea and chest tightness were independent predictors of death. As for laboratory examinations, significantly increased pretreatment absolute leukocytosis count, LDH, PCT, D-Dimer and ferritin, and decreased pretreatment absolute lymphocyte count were found in non-survivors, which also have an unbeneficial impact on mortality among COVID-19 patients. Motoring these indicators during the hospitalization plays a very important role in predicting the prognosis of patients.

## Introduction

Since December 2019, the pandemic of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) pneumonia has caused more than 8 million infections, with 440,290 deaths worldwide until June 17th, 2020 [1]. Increasing evidence is investigating the clinical features and laboratory abnormalities in patients with COVID-19 infection. Considering the wide-spread of COVID-19, early and accurate prognosis prediction is urgently warranted. However, the specific symptoms and laboratory biomarkers which may help predict the poor prognosis of COVID-19 patients were unclear. Therefore, we aimed to perform a systematic meta-analysis to summarize the clinical characteristics and laboratory test before treatment among COVID-19 patients and identify the possible risk factors for mortality.

# Materials and methods

#### Search strategy

We conducted a systematic search in PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science and Embase to identify studies in patients with COVID-19 infection up to 4 June 2020. The following keywords were used: "2019 novel coronavirus disease", "severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2", "COVID-19", "2019-nCoV", "SARS-CoV-2" and "clinical", "laboratory", "risk factor", and "mortality", "mortal", "fatality", "fatal", "lethality" or "death". No restrictions on publication status were imposed. Only studies published in English and Chinese were retrieved for this meta-analysis. In addition, reference lists of relevant records were manually screened for further potentially eligible articles.

#### Inclusion criteria and exclusion criteria

Two researchers reviewed all articles independently based on titles and abstracts. The inclusion criteria were as follows: 1) all patients were confirmed with COVID-19; 2) studies reported the clinical characteristics, hematological and serological abnormalities both in survivors and non-survivors.

The exclusion criteria were as follows: 1) reviews, letters, case reports, conference abstracts and duplicated publications; 2) insufficient data were provided for extrapolating the mean±SD for hematologic parameters.

#### Data extraction and assessment of risk of bias

Studies that met the inclusion and exclusion criteria underwent full-text rescreening. Data extraction was performed by two investigators independently. The following data were

collected: the name of first author, publication year, region of studies, number of the patients with COVID-19, clinical characteristics together with of the laboratory examination in each group. Continuous data were extracted as mean ± standard deviation (SD). While data were expressed as median, range and/or interquartile range (IQR), mean and SD were extrapolated according to Wan et al. [2]. Any disagreements were resolved via discussion and consensus. The risk of bias of each included study was assessed by utilizing the MINORS score [3].

#### Statistical analysis

ORs together with the weighted mean difference (WMD) and the 95% confidence interval (CI) were merged and we assessed heterogeneity by using Cochran's Q statistic test and the I<sup>2</sup> statistic. When p-values for heterogeneity were no greater than 0.05 or I<sup>2</sup> value exceeded 50%, random-model was applied. Otherwise, the fixed-effects model was adopted. We explored the publication bias by the Egger's regression test and the funnel plot. All statistical analyses were conducted by Review Manager (version 5.3), and R (version 3.6.1). Two-tailed P values  $\leq 0.05$  were considered statistically significant.

#### Results

#### Literature search and assessment of risk of bias

A total of 3093 potentially relevant publications were yielded according to our search strategy from PubMed, Scopus, Web of Science and Embase up to 4 June 2020. One additional relevant study was identified from the reference list of included articles. We discarded 1177 articles as duplicates. Two researchers reviewed 1917 articles based on titles and abstracts. After 1839 irrelevant records were excluded, we screened the full text versions of the remaining 78 articles. The following studies were eliminated: reviews, meta-analyses or case reports and studies lacking sufficient data for further analysis. Ultimately, thirty-one qualified articles [4–34] were included in this meta-analysis. The detailed process of the literature search was presented in **Fig 1**. All included studies were non-randomized. The MINORS scores varied between 18 and 21, suggesting a low risk of bias overall (**Table 1 and S1 Table**).

#### Characteristics of included studies

As shown in Table 1, the included studies were carried out in China (n = 27), Spain (n = 1), Italy (n = 1), Iran (n = 1) and Poland (n = 1). In total, 9407 confirmed COVID-19 patients were included, of which 7856 were survivors and 1551 were non-survivors. The mean or median age of survivors varied from 40 to 69 years, and that of the non-survivors ranged between 63 to 75.3 years. The proportions of male patients in survivors and non-survivors were 52% and 65%, respectively. For comorbidities, similar to the findings of Ielapi N et al. [35], a history of hypertension was more common among non-survivors (52%) than among survivors (29%). Similar to hypertension, non-survivors were more likely to report having diabetes, malignancy, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, chronic cardiac disease, cerebrovascular disease and chronic renal disease (Table 1). Clinical characteristics included fever, cough, dyspnea, fatigue, diarrhea, myalgia, expectoration, headache, emesis, pharyngalgia, anorexia, abdominal pain, dizziness, hemoptysis, nausea, chest pain, chest tightness and shiver. As for laboratory test, we focused on leukocytes, lymphocytes, procalcitonin (PCT), D-Dimer, lactate dehydrogenase (LDH) and ferritin. Of these studies, nineteen studies provided the clinical characteristics and the laboratory findings of COVID-19 patients [6-9, 11-13, 15, 17, 20, 22, 24, 26–28, 31–34], seven studies only targeted the clinical characteristics [4, 5, 14, 16, 18, 23, 29], and another five studies only focused on the laboratory findings [10, 19, 21, 25, 30].



#### Fig 1. Flow chart of the literature search.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124.g001

#### Meta-analysis results of clinical characteristics

Twenty-six studies involving 7274 COVID-19 patients (5926 survivors and 1348 non-survivors) provided data regarding clinical characteristics (**S2 Table**). The association between various clinical characteristics and the risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients were shown in **Fig 2**. Compared with survivors, non-survivors were more likely to present with dyspnea (66% vs. 34%), chest tightness (46% vs. 30%), hemoptysis (4% vs. 3%), expectoration (42% vs. 32%) and fatigue (50% vs. 44%) (**S2 Table**). In addition, dyspnea, chest tightness, hemoptysis, expectoration and fatigue were observed as significant poor risk factors of mortality (dyspnea: OR = 4.52, 95%CI [3.15, 6.48], P<0.001; chest tightness: OR = 2.50, 95%CI [1.78, 3.52], P<0.001; hemoptysis: OR = 2.00, 95%CI [1.02, 3.93], P = 0.045; expectoration: OR = 1.52, 95% CI [1.17, 1.97], P = 0.002; and fatigue: OR = 1.27, 95%CI [1.09, 1.48], P = 0.003). The heterogeneity test results of dyspnea, chest tightness, hemoptysis, expectoration and fatigue evaluated by I<sup>2</sup> were 79%, 2%, 0%, 51% and 10%, respectively. However, no significant relationships were found between mortality and fever, cough, diarrhea, headache, abdominal pain, dizziness, nausea, chest pain and so on (**Fig 2**).

#### Meta-analysis results of laboratory findings

A total of twenty-four studies consisting of 5900 cases (4639 survivors and 1261 non-survivors) reported laboratory findings of COVID-19 patients (S3 Table). We compared the pretreatment absolute leukocytes count, absolute leukocytes count, LDH, D-Dimer, PCT and ferritin between survivors and non-survivors. Compared with survivors, significant increases were found in non-

Table 1. Cha	racteris	tics of all	included stu	dies.																			
Author	Year	Country	Gity	MINORS score	Total SNS	_	Ag	e S	Male S N	(%) IS	Hyperte (%) S N	I noion I	) iabetes (' S NS	× (%	falignan (%) S NS	cy C	CD (%) S NS	0 5	B (%) SNS	CRI	0 (%) NS	COPD ( S NS	(%)
Cao JL	2020	China	Wuhan	18	85	17	53 (47, 66)	72 (63, 81)	47	77	20	65	6 3	5	4	5 2	18	4	18	-	18	I NA	NA
Chen RC	2020	China	Guangzhou	19	445	103	53.5 (13.9)	66.9 (12.1)	55	67	23	44	9 1	6	3	3 N/	A NA	2	8	3	2	0	5
Chen RC (2)	2020	China	Guangzhou	21	1540	50	48 (1–94) <sup>a</sup>	69 (51–86) <sup>a</sup>	57	78	16	56	8 2	9	1	5 N/	A NA	2	12	-	10	1	12
Chen T	2020	China	Wuhan	21	161	113	51 (37, 66)	68 (62, 77)	55	74	24	48	14 2			4 4	14	0	4	-	4	NA J	NA
Deng Y	2020	China	Wuhan	18	116	109	40 (33, 57)	69 (62, 74)	44	67	16	37	8 1	9	5	5 3	12	NA	NA	NA	NA	I NA	NA
Du RH	2020	China	Wuhan	19	158	21	56 (13.5)	70.2 (7.7)	55	48	29	62	17 2	6	6	N/ 2	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Fan H *	2020	China	Wuhan	19	26	47	46.2 (12)	65.5 (9.7)	65	68	12	45	NA N	A	IA D	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	I NA	NA
Goicoechea M	2020	Spain	Madrid	18	25	Ξ	69 (14)	75 (6)	68	55	100	91	68 5	2 2	A N	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	32	6
Giacomelli A	2020	Italy	Milan	19	185	48	NA	NA	34	19	NA	NA	NA N	A	IA D	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	I NA	NA
Huang J	2020	China	Yichang	18	283	16	52.5 (16.6)	69.2 (9.7)	53	69	22	69	11 2	2	6	5 N/	A NA	4	13	NA	NA	2	19
Javanian M	2020	Iran	Babol	18	81	19	57.7 (13.6)	69.3 (11.1)	49	57	25	63	33 5	3	1	6 15	42	-	11	6	26	9	26
LILL	2020	China	Wuhan	19	68	25	43.7 (13.1)	69 (10.5)	38	60	0	20	9 2		4	4 0	16	NA	NA	NA	NA	6	~
Nowak B	2020	Poland	Warsaw	18	123	46	59.3 (20.1)	75.3 (11.9)	46	65	43	59	13 3	2		3 29	48	NA	NA	22	17	11	20
Ruan QR	2020	China	Wuhan	19	82	68	50 (44, 81)	67 (15, 81)	65	72	28	43	16 1	~		0	19	9	10	0	3	-	e,
Shi Q	2020	China	Wuhan	21	259	47	NA	NA	47	60	38	68	NA N	A	4	9 12	36	ŝ	15	e	11	I NA	NA
Shi SB *	2020	China	Shanghai	21	609	62	61 (49, 70)	74 (66, 81)	47	57	27	60	13 2	-	3	2 N/	A NA	2	13	3	19	3	3
Sun H	2020	China	Wuhan	18	123	121	67 (64, 72)	72 (66, 78)	42	68	50	63	20 2	3	IA N	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	I NA	NA
Tang N	2020	China	Wuhan	19	162	21	52.4 (15.6)	64 (20.7)	51	76	NA	NA	NA N	A	IA D	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA ]	NA
Wang DW	2020	China	Wuhan	19	88	19	44.5 (35, 58.8)	73 (64, 81)	47	84	18	53	7 2	2 9	IA N	A 7	37	3	16	5	5	2	5
Wang K	2020	China	Wuhan	21	470	78	58 (46–67) <sup>a</sup>	67 (61.8–78) <sup>a</sup>	48	71	27	49	14 2	4	5	4 N/	A NA	NA	NA	-	9	2	6
Wang L $(1)^{1}$	2020	China	Wuhan	18	274	65	68 (64, 74)	76 (70, 83)	46	60	39	50	16 1	-	4	5 12	33	4	16	3	6	4	17
Wang L (2)	2020	China	Wuhan	19	169	33	61 (49, 67)	74 (65, 84)	39	70	26	49	11 1	5	4	5 7	15	7	21	6	12	2	15
Wang Y *	2020	China	Nanjing	19	211	133	57 (47–69)	70 (62–77)	50	56	34	52	16 2	3	IA N	A 9	17	NA	NA	NA	NA	1	10
Wu CM *	2020	China	Wuhan	19	40	44	50 (40.3, 56.8)	68.5 (59.3, 75)	78	99	18	36	13 2	2	A N	A 10	6	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Xu PP	2020	China	MC	21	659	33	45 (14.6)	64.7 (13.4)	53	73	14	52	7 3	9	-	3	36	NA	NA	-	6	-	12
Xu B	2020	China	Wuhan	21	117	28	56 (43, 66)	73 (68, 77.3)	50	61	18	36	NA N	A A	A	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	7	~	NA	NA
Yang XB *	2020	China	Wuhan	19	20	32	51.9 (12.9)	64.6 (11.2)	70	66	NA	NA	10 2	5	5	3 10	6	0	22	NA	NA	NA I	NA
Yang KY	2020	China	MCr	21	165	40	62 (57, 69)	63 (53, 75)	41	73	34	28	12	2	A	A N/	A NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	ю	0
Yan XS	2020	China	Wuhan	19	964	40	62 (50, 70)	68 (58, 79)	48	68	22	50	10 2	5	-	8 N/	A NA	7	23	NA	NA	-	0
Zhang J *	2020	China	Wuhan	18	Ξ	8	68 (38, 87)	77 (66, 91)	55	63	55	63	9 3	~	A	0 V.	38	6	25	NA	NA	NA	NA
Zhou F	2020	China	Wuhan	21	137	54	52 (45, 58)	69 (63, 76)	59	70	23	48	14 3	5	5	/N (	A NA	NA	NA	0	4	2	~
Abbreviation: obstructive pu	- COVII Ilmonar	)-19, coro v disease:	navirus dise. MINORS: N	ase 2019; S: surv 1ethodological I	ivors; N ndex fo	S: nor r Non	1-survivors; C -Randomized	CD: Chronic o Studies: NA. 1	cardia Not a	ıc dise vailab	ase; C] le: MC	B: Cere : Multi	brovasc -center.	ular d	lisease	CRD:	Chron	.c rena	l diseas	ie; COI	D: Ch	ronic	
obstructive pu	ılmonaı	y disease;	MINORS: N	1ethodological I	ndex fo	r Non	-Randomized	Studies; NA, 1	Not a	vailab	le; MC	: Multi	-center										

a: Reported as median (range). Other studies were reported as median (IQR) or mean (SD).

\*: All patients with ARDS or severe/critically ill patients. <sup>1</sup>: All patients were over 60 years old.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124.t001

Ĩ.

.

Clinical manifestation	No. of Patients	No. of Research	OR(95 %0	CI)	l <sup>2</sup>	P Value
Dyspnea	6556	21		4.52 (3.15, 6.48)	79%	<0.001
Chest tightness	904	3	1 <b>•</b>	2.50 (1.78, 3.52)	2%	0.359
Hemoptysis	1476	6	입 것 되는 누구 이상에 잘 많다. 이것은 것은	2.00 (1.02, 3.93)	0%	0.517
Expectoration	4455	14	Heri	1.52 (1.17, 1.97)	51%	0.014
Fatigue	5912	20		1.27 (1.09, 1.48)	10%	0.333
Anorexia	1708	8	<b>⊢</b> ●−−−1	1.53 (0.99, 2.37)	56%	0.026
Dizziness	1513	6	<b>⊢●</b> →↓	1.29 (0.85, 1.98)	0%	0.702
Chest pain	845	4	1 <b>0</b> -1	1.14 (0.62, 2.10)	41%	0.164
Fever	7192	26		1.06 (0.88, 1.27)	0%	0.852
Nausea	1557	5	1 <b>-</b>	1.01 (0.59, 1.74)	45%	0.123
Cough	7146	25		0.93 (0.73, 1.18)	57%	0.000
Emesis	1629	6	H <b>-</b> H	0.89 (0.54, 1.49)	37%	0.159
Headache	5076	14	•••	0.84 (0.61, 1.14)	9%	0.353
Myalgia	3826	15	H <b>9</b> -	0.83 (0.66, 1.05)	0%	0.706
Diarrhea	6290	19	H	0.82 (0.67, 1.01)	0%	0.474
Pharyngalgia	2294	8	H	0.73 (0.44, 1.19)	26%	0.224
Abdominal pain	1965	6	<b>⊢●</b> −	0.71 (0.39, 1.31)	0%	0.683
Shiver	2086	3		0.68 (0.37, 1.23)	3%	0.359
2월 12일, 11일 <u>- 11</u> 2월 2일, 2일, 11일 - 11일		-0.5	0.5 1.5 2.5 3.5 4.5 5.5	6.5		

Fig 2. Meta-analysis results of the relationship between clinical manifestation and the increasing risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients. Abbreviation: OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124.g002

survivors in pretreatment absolute leukocytes count (WMD =  $3.27 \times 10^9$ /L, 95% CI [2.34, 4.21], P<0.001) (Table 2, S1 Fig) and we further observed significant negative correlation between the risk of mortality and decreased pretreatment absolute leukocytes count (OR = 0.32, 95%CI [0.22, 0.46], P<0.001; I<sup>2</sup> = 44%, P = 0.11) (Fig 3). The mean value of pretreatment absolute lymphocytes count was significantly decreased in non-survivors with a WMD of  $-0.39 \times 10^9$ /L, 95% CI [-0.46, -0.33]; P<0.001) compared with survivors (Table 2, S1 Fig) and the reduction of pretreatment absolute lymphocytes count was also significantly related to the increased risk of mortality (OR = 9.83, 95%CI [6.72, 14.38], P<0.001). No pronounced heterogeneity was observed by the heterogeneity test (I<sup>2</sup> = 0%, P = 0.515) (Fig 3). What's more, LDH, D-Dimer, PCT and ferritin were also found to be elevated in non-survivors (Table 2, S1 Fig) and the increased indicators mentioned above were also associated with increased risk of mortality (Fig 3).

#### **Publication bias**

The funnel plots and Egger's tests showed that there was no evidence of publication bias either in any clinical characteristic analysis or in any laboratory test analysis (S2 and S3 Figs).

#### Discussion

In this article, we summarized the incidence of some common symptoms of COVID-19 infections and found that dyspnea, chest tightness, hemoptysis, expectoration and fatigue were

Table 2.	Meta-anal	vsis results o	of comparing	g laborator	v abnormalities between	n survivor and nor	n-survivor COVID-19 pat	ients.
----------	-----------	----------------	--------------	-------------	-------------------------	--------------------	-------------------------	--------

1	1	1			
No. of the studies	No. of the patients	WMD	Р	Test of I	neterogeneity <sup>2</sup> (%) <i>P</i>
19	5408	3.27 (2.34, 4.21)	< 0.001	90	< 0.001
20	4825	-0.39 (-0.46, -0.33)	< 0.001	83	< 0.001
13	3336	211.60 (148.63, 274.57)	< 0.001	68	0.008
11	3330	0.31 (0.20, 0.42)	< 0.001	88	< 0.001
17	3108	4.97 (3.55, 6.39)	< 0.001	90	< 0.001
6	1500	770.05 (530.34, 1009.76)	< 0.001	86	< 0.001
	No. of the studies   19   20   13   11   17   6	No. of the studies No. of the patients   19 5408   20 4825   13 3336   11 3330   17 3108   6 1500	No. of the studies No. of the patients WMD   19 5408 3.27 (2.34, 4.21)   20 4825 -0.39 (-0.46, -0.33)   13 3336 211.60 (148.63, 274.57)   11 3330 0.31 (0.20, 0.42)   17 3108 4.97 (3.55, 6.39)   6 1500 770.05 (530.34, 1009.76)	No. of the studies No. of the patients WMD P   19 5408 3.27 (2.34, 4.21) <0.001	No. of the studies No. of the patients WMD P Test of I   19 5408 3.27 (2.34, 4.21) <0.001

Abbreviation: WMD, weighted mean difference; LDH, lactate dehydrogenase.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124.t002

Laboratory examination	No. of Patients	No. of Research		OR(95	%CI)	l <sup>2</sup>	P Value
Leukocytes (×109/L)							
Increased	3394	7	- 1 - F	• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	11.11(6.85, 18.032)	649	6 0.011
Decreased	3161	6	•		0.32 (0.22, 0.46)	449	6 0.110
Lymphocytes (×109/L)							
Decreased	3489	7	F	• · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	9.83 (6.72, 14.38)	09	6 0.515
LDH (U/L)							
Increased	2289	5		- •	20.86 (12.31, 35.35)	09	6 0.670
PCT (ng/mL)							
Increased	2526	5	H		10.15 (6.70, 15.38)	489	6 0.104
D-Dimer (µg/mL)							
Increased	2961	8	H	<b></b>	7.70 (4.72, 12.57)	579	6 0.023
Ferritin (ng/mL)							
Increased	893	3		•	9.65 (4.14, 22.47)	09	6 0.935
			-3 7	17 27	37		

Fig 3. Meta-analysis results of the relationship between laboratory abnormalities and the increasing risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients. Abbreviation: OR, odds ratio; CI, confidence interval.

https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243124.g003

significantly associated with poor prognosis in COVID-19 patients. For laboratory tests, our study indicated significant increased pretreatment absolute leukocytes count and decreased pretreatment absolute lymphocytes count were observed in non-survivors and they were also associated with the increased risk of mortality in COVID-19 patients.

As an emerging infectious disease, the rapid global rise of COVID-19 pneumonia infections and deaths has attracted significant attention. To foresee the prognosis of COVID-19 infected individuals, it is essential to ascertain the risk factors for death fast and reliably. A large number of clinical studies have explored the clinical characteristics and laboratory examinations of severe and critical COVID-19 patients. Zheng et al. [36] reported that the fever, shortness of breath or dyspnea indicated the disease deterioration. Our results were consistent with the findings of Shi et al. that the presence of dyspnea was risk factors for death, rather than fever [37]. Another recent retrospective study of 179 patients with confirmed COVID-19 found that fatigue and expectoration were more frequently observed in non-survivors than survivors, which were associated with increased risk of mortality [9]. Hemoptysis was an uncommon symptom in COVID-19 patients [38]. In several studies, the incidence of hemoptysis was higher in survivors [9, 14], while many others reported that hemoptysis occurred more often in non-survivors [6, 7, 17], consistent with our observations. More researches on the role of hemoptysis in predicting the prognosis of COVID-19 patients was required.

For laboratory tests, in addition to pretreatment absolute leukocytes and lymphocytes count, increased LDH, PCT, and ferritin were also observed in non-survivors. Further analyses showed them were all associated with the mortality of patients.

Concerning lymphocyte, some studies found no significant correlation between lymphocyte counts and the severity of the disease [39, 40], whereas other research concluded that lymphopenia was a good predictor of disease progression [41, 42]. The present study is the first meta-analysis, which identified the correlation between lymphopenia and mortality in COVID-19 patients. Regardless of the baseline disease severity, lymphocyte was significantly lower on admission and maintained a lower level during hospitalization in non-survivors, while it increased after treatment in survivors [6–8, 43, 44]. The lymphopenia may result from destruction of lymphocytes (particularly T lymphocytes) and suppression of the proliferation of lymphocytes caused by virus invasion, and recovered lymphocyte could be a predictor of gradual recovery [45]. The present study had some limitations that should be acknowledged. First, all included studies were retrospective. Secondly, subgroup analyses were not performed due to the limited data we can draw from the enrolled studies. Additionally, due to the limitations of language, we included the studies written in English and Chinese only.

#### Conclusions

To sum up, we found that dyspnea, chest tightness, hemoptysis, expectoration and fatigue were predictors of increased risk of mortality. Besides, significantly increased pretreatment absolute leukocyte count, PCT, D-Dimer, LDH and ferritin, and decreased pretreatment absolute lymphocyte count were identified in non-survivors, which were all related to increased risk of mortality. Motoring these indicators during the hospitalization of patients plays a very important role in predicting the prognosis of patients. Collectively, our results are helpful in clinical practice, which should be verified by additional large-sample or multi-center studies.

### Supporting information

**S1 Fig.** Forest plot of the laboratory abnormalities (A) leukocytes, (B) lymphocytes, (C) lactate dehydrogenase (LDH), (D) procalcitonin, (E) D-Dimer, (F) ferritin levels in survivors versus non-survivors.

(TIF)

**S2 Fig.** The publication bias of the clinical characteristics (A. dyspnea; B. chest tightness; C. hemoptysis; D. expectoration; E. fatigue; F. anorexia; G. dizziness; H. chest pain; I. fever; J. nausea; K. cough; L. emesis; M. headache; N. myalgia; O. diarrhea; P. pharyngalgia; Q. abdominal pain; R. shiver) between survivors and non-survivors. (TIF)

**S3 Fig.** The publication bias of the laboratory abnormalities (A) increased leukocytes, (B) decreased leukocytes, (C) decreased lymphocytes, (D) increased lactate dehydrogenase (LDH), (E) increased procalcitonin (PCT), (F) increased D-Dimer, (G) increased ferritin between survivors and non-survivors.

(TIF)

**S1** Table. The results of the quality assessment for each individual study. (XLSX)

**S2 Table. Clinical characteristics of survivor and non-survivor COVID-19 patients.** Abbreviation: CI, confidence interval; NA, not available. (XLSX)

**S3 Table. Laboratory abnormalities of survivor and non-survivor COVID-19 patients.** Abbreviation: CI, confidence interval; SD, standard deviation. (XLSX)

**S1 File. Prisma-2009-checklist.** (DOC)

S2 File. Search strategy for meta-analysis of risk factors for predicting mortality of COVID-19 patients (PubMed via NLM). (DOCX)

#### **Author Contributions**

Conceptualization: Jing Jin, Bojiang Chen, Weimin Li.

Data curation: Lan Yang.

Formal analysis: Lan Yang.

Funding acquisition: Wenxin Luo, Weimin Li.

Methodology: Jing Jin, Wenxin Luo, Yuncui Gan.

Software: Lan Yang, Jing Jin, Wenxin Luo, Yuncui Gan.

Supervision: Bojiang Chen, Weimin Li.

Validation: Yuncui Gan.

Visualization: Wenxin Luo.

Writing - original draft: Lan Yang, Jing Jin, Wenxin Luo, Yuncui Gan.

Writing - review & editing: Bojiang Chen, Weimin Li.

#### References

- Guo YR, Cao QD, Hong ZS, Tan YY, Chen SD, Jin HJ, et al. The origin, transmission and clinical therapies on coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) outbreak—an update on the status. Military Medical Research. 2020; 7(1):11. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40779-020-00240-0 PMID: 32169119
- Wan X, Wang W, Liu J, Tong T. Estimating the sample mean and standard deviation from the sample size, median, range and/or interquartile range. BMC Med Res Methodol. 2014; 14:135–. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-14-135">https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2288-14-135</a> PMID: 25524443
- Slim K, Nini E, Forestier D, Kwiatkowski F, Panis Y, Chipponi J. Methodological index for non-randomized studies (MINORS): development and validation of a new instrument. ANZ Journal of Surgery. 2003; 73(9):712–6. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1445-2197.2003.02748.x PMID: 12956787
- Cao J, Tu WJ, Cheng W, Yu L, Liu YK, Hu X, et al. Clinical Features and Short-term Outcomes of 102 Patients with Corona Virus Disease 2019 in Wuhan, China. Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America. 2020.
- Chen R, Liang W, Jiang M, Guan W, Zhan C, Wang T, et al. Risk Factors of Fatal Outcome in Hospitalized Subjects With Coronavirus Disease 2019 From a Nationwide Analysis in China. Chest. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chest.2020.04.010 PMID: 32304772
- Chen R, Sang L, Jiang M, Yang Z, Jia N, Fu W, et al. Longitudinal hematologic and immunologic variations associated with the progression of COVID-19 patients in China. The Journal of allergy and clinical immunology. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaci.2020.05.003 PMID: 32407836
- Chen T, Wu D, Chen H, Yan W, Yang D, Chen G, et al. Clinical characteristics of 113 deceased patients with coronavirus disease 2019: retrospective study. BMJ (Clinical research ed). 2020; 368:m1091. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m1091 PMID: 32217556
- Deng Y, Liu W, Liu K, Fang YY, Shang J, Zhou L, et al. Clinical characteristics of fatal and recovered cases of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Wuhan, China: a retrospective study. Chinese medical journal. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1097/CM9.00000000000824 PMID: 32209890
- Du RH, Liang LR, Yang CQ, Wang W, Cao TZ, Li M, et al. Predictors of mortality for patients with COVID-19 pneumonia caused by SARS-CoV-2: a prospective cohort study. The European respiratory journal. 2020; 55(5).
- Fan H, Zhang L, Huang B, Zhu M, Zhou Y, Zhang H, et al. Cardiac injuries in patients with coronavirus disease 2019: Not to be ignored. International journal of infectious diseases: IJID: official publication of the International Society for Infectious Diseases. 2020; 96:294–7. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.05.</u> 024 PMID: 32437935
- Giacomelli A, Ridolfo AL, Milazzo L, Oreni L, Bernacchia D, Siano M, et al. 30-day mortality in patients hospitalized with COVID-19 during the first wave of the Italian epidemic: a prospective cohort study. Pharmacological research. 2020:104931. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phrs.2020.104931 PMID: 32446978
- 12. Goicoechea M, Sánchez Cámara LA, Macías N, Muñoz de Morales A, González Rojas Á, Bascuñana A, et al. COVID-19: Clinical course and outcomes of 36 maintenance hemodialysis patients from a

single center in Spain. Kidney international. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kint.2020.04.031 PMID: 32437770

- Huang J, Cheng A, Kumar R, Fang Y, Chen G, Zhu Y, et al. Hypoalbuminemia predicts the outcome of COVID-19 independent of age and co-morbidity. Journal of medical virology. 2020. <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26003</u> PMID: 32406952
- 14. Javanian M, Bayani M, Shokri M, Sadeghi-Haddad-Zavareh M, Babazadeh A, Yeganeh B, et al. Clinical and laboratory findings from patients with COVID-19 pneumonia in Babol North of Iran: a retrospective cohort study. Romanian journal of internal medicine = Revue roumaine de medecine interne. 2020. https://doi.org/10.2478/rjim-2020-0013 PMID: 32396143
- Li L, Yang L, Gui S, Pan F, Ye T, Liang B, et al. Association of clinical and radiographic findings with the outcomes of 93 patients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China. Theranostics. 2020; 10(14):6113–21. <a href="https://doi.org/10.7150/thno.46569">https://doi.org/10.7150/thno.46569</a> PMID: 32483442
- Nowak B, Szymański P, Pańkowski I, Szarowska A, Życińska K, Rogowski W, et al. Clinical characteristics and short-term outcomes of patients with coronavirus disease 2019: a retrospective single-center experience of a designated hospital in Poland. Polish archives of internal medicine. 2020; 130(5):407– 11. https://doi.org/10.20452/pamw.15361 PMID: 32420710
- Ruan Q, Yang K, Wang W, Jiang L, Song J. Clinical predictors of mortality due to COVID-19 based on an analysis of data of 150 patients from Wuhan, China. Intensive care medicine. 2020; 46(5):846–8. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00134-020-05991-x PMID: 32125452
- Shi Q, Zhang X, Jiang F, Zhang X, Hu N, Bimu C, et al. Clinical Characteristics and Risk Factors for Mortality of COVID-19 Patients With Diabetes in Wuhan, China: A Two-Center, Retrospective Study. Diabetes care. 2020. https://doi.org/10.2337/dc20-0598 PMID: 32409504
- Shi S, Qin M, Cai Y, Liu T, Shen B, Yang F, et al. Characteristics and clinical significance of myocardial injury in patients with severe coronavirus disease 2019. European heart journal. 2020. https://doi.org/ 10.1093/eurhearti/ehaa408 PMID: 32391877
- Sun H, Ning R, Tao Y, Yu C, Deng X, Zhao C, et al. Risk Factors for Mortality in 244 Older Adults With COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: A Retrospective Study. Journal of the American Geriatrics Society. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1111/jgs.16533 PMID: 32383809
- Tang N, Li D, Wang X, Sun Z. Abnormal coagulation parameters are associated with poor prognosis in patients with novel coronavirus pneumonia. Journal of thrombosis and haemostasis: JTH. 2020; 18 (4):844–7. https://doi.org/10.1111/jth.14768 PMID: 32073213
- 22. Wang D, Yin Y, Hu C, Liu X, Zhang X, Zhou S, et al. Clinical course and outcome of 107 patients infected with the novel coronavirus, SARS-CoV-2, discharged from two hospitals in Wuhan, China. Critical care (London, England). 2020; 24(1):188. https://doi.org/10.1186/s13054-020-02895-6 PMID: 32354360
- Wang K, Zhang Z, Yu M, Tao Y, Xie M. 15-day mortality and associated risk factors for hospitalized patients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: an ambispective observational cohort study. Intensive care medicine. 2020:1–3. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00134-020-06047-w PMID: 32328724
- 24. Wang L, He W, Yu X, Hu D, Bao M, Liu H, et al. Coronavirus disease 2019 in elderly patients: Characteristics and prognostic factors based on 4-week follow-up. The Journal of infection. 2020; 80(6):639–45. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.03.019 PMID: 32240670
- Wang L, He WB, Yu XM, Liu HF, Zhou WJ, Jiang H. Prognostic value of myocardial injury in patients with COVID-19. [Zhonghua yan ke za zhi] Chinese journal of ophthalmology. 2020; 56(0):E009. https:// doi.org/10.3760/cma.j.cn112148-20200313-00202 PMID: 32283877
- Wang Y, Lu X, Li Y, Chen H, Chen T, Su N, et al. Clinical Course and Outcomes of 344 Intensive Care Patients with COVID-19. American journal of respiratory and critical care medicine. 2020; 201 (11):1430–4. https://doi.org/10.1164/rccm.202003-0736LE PMID: 32267160
- Wu C, Chen X, Cai Y, Xia J, Zhou X, Xu S, et al. Risk Factors Associated With Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome and Death in Patients With Coronavirus Disease 2019 Pneumonia in Wuhan, China. JAMA internal medicine. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2020.0994 PMID: 32167524
- Xu B, Fan CY, Wang AL, Zou YL, Yu YH, He C, et al. Suppressed T cell-mediated immunity in patients with COVID-19: A clinical retrospective study in Wuhan, China. The Journal of infection. 2020.
- 29. Xu PP, Tian RH, Luo S, Zu ZY, Fan B, Wang XM, et al. Risk factors for adverse clinical outcomes with COVID-19 in China: a multicenter, retrospective, observational study. Theranostics. 2020; 10 (14):6372–83. https://doi.org/10.7150/thno.46833 PMID: 32483458
- Yan X, Li F, Wang X, Yan J, Zhu F, Tang S, et al. Neutrophil to Lymphocyte Ratio as Prognostic and Predictive Factor in Patients with Coronavirus Disease 2019: A Retrospective Cross-sectional Study. Journal of medical virology. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.26061 PMID: 32458459

- **31.** Yang K, Sheng Y, Huang C, Jin Y, Xiong N, Jiang K, et al. Clinical characteristics, outcomes, and risk factors for mortality in patients with cancer and COVID-19 in Hubei, China: a multicentre, retrospective, cohort study. The Lancet Oncology. 2020.
- 32. Yang X, Yu Y, Xu J, Shu H, Xia J, Liu H, et al. Clinical course and outcomes of critically ill patients with SARS-CoV-2 pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a single-centered, retrospective, observational study. The Lancet Respiratory medicine. 2020; 8(5):475–81. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S2213-2600(20)30079-5</u> PMID: 32105632
- **33.** Zhang J, Liu P, Wang M, Wang J, Chen J, Yuan W, et al. The clinical data from 19 critically ill patients with coronavirus disease 2019: a single-centered, retrospective, observational study. Zeitschrift fur Gesundheitswissenschaften = Journal of public health. 2020:1–4.
- Zhou F, Yu T, Du R, Fan G, Liu Y, Liu Z, et al. Clinical course and risk factors for mortality of adult inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort study. Lancet (London, England). 2020; 395(10229):1054–62. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30566-3 PMID: 32171076
- Ielapi N, Licastro N, Provenzano M, Andreucci M, Franciscis Sd, Serra R. Cardiovascular disease as a biomarker for an increased risk of COVID-19 infection and related poor prognosis. Biomark Med. 2020; 14(9):713–6. https://doi.org/10.2217/bmm-2020-0201 PMID: 32426991
- Zheng Z, Peng F, Xu B, Zhao J, Liu H, Peng J, et al. Risk factors of critical & mortal COVID-19 cases: A systematic literature review and meta-analysis. The Journal of infection. 2020:S0163–4453(20)30234-6.
- Shi L, Wang Y, Wang Y, Duan G, Yang H. Dyspnea rather than fever is a risk factor for predicting mortality in patients with COVID-19. The Journal of infection. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.05. 013 PMID: 32417316
- Guan WJ, Ni ZY, Hu Y, Liang WH, Ou CQ, He JX, et al. Clinical Characteristics of Coronavirus Disease 2019 in China. The New England journal of medicine. 2020; 382(18):1708–20. https://doi.org/10.1056/ NEJMoa2002032 PMID: 32109013
- Fu L, Wang B, Yuan T, Chen X, Ao Y, Fitzpatrick T, et al. Clinical characteristics of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in China: A systematic review and meta-analysis. The Journal of infection. 2020; 80 (6):656–65. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jinf.2020.03.041 PMID: 32283155
- 40. Chen L, Liu HG, Liu W, Liu J, Liu K, Shang J, et al. Analysis of clinical features of 29 patients with 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia. Zhonghua jie he he hu xi za zhi = Zhonghua jiehe he huxi zazhi = Chinese journal of tuberculosis and respiratory diseases. 2020; 43(0):E005. <u>https://doi.org/10.3760/cma.j.</u> issn.1001-0939.2020.0005 PMID: 32026671
- Zhao Q, Meng M, Kumar R, Wu Y, Huang J, Deng Y, et al. Lymphopenia is associated with severe coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) infections: A systemic review and meta-analysis. International journal of infectious diseases: IJID: official publication of the International Society for Infectious Diseases. 2020; 96:131–5. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.04.086 PMID: 32376308
- Huang I, Pranata R. Lymphopenia in severe coronavirus disease-2019 (COVID-19): systematic review and meta-analysis. Journal of intensive care. 2020; 8:36–. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40560-020-00453-4 PMID: 32483488
- 43. Chen N, Zhou M, Dong X, Qu J, Gong F, Han Y, et al. Epidemiological and clinical characteristics of 99 cases of 2019 novel coronavirus pneumonia in Wuhan, China: a descriptive study. Lancet (London, England). 2020; 395(10223):507–13. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30211-7 PMID: 32007143
- 44. Guan WJ, Liang WH, Zhao Y, Liang HR, Chen ZS, Li YM, et al. Comorbidity and its impact on 1590 patients with COVID-19 in China: a nationwide analysis. The European respiratory journal. 2020; 55(5). https://doi.org/10.1183/13993003.00547-2020 PMID: 32217650
- 45. Gu J, Gong E, Zhang B, Zheng J, Gao Z, Zhong Y, et al. Multiple organ infection and the pathogenesis of SARS. The Journal of experimental medicine. 2005; 202(3):415–24. https://doi.org/10.1084/jem. 20050828 PMID: 16043521