**S3 Table. Robustness of results and conclusions of the analyses (including *p*-uniform estimates)**

| Distribution | Lowest value | $$\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$$ | Highest value | BRE | Practical difference | MRE | Practical difference | Conclusion a |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Conscientiousness | .12 f | .16 | .19 h |  .04 (25%) | moderate |  .07 (44%) | large | Moderate to large difference |
| Frame of reference |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Non-contextualized | .09 f | .15 | .20 h |  .06 (40%) | large |  .07 (47%) | large | Large difference |
| - Contextualized | .17 d, g | .19 | .20 c |  .02 (11%) | negligible |  .03 (16%) | negligible | Negligible difference |
| Source |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Journal articles | .07 g | .19 | .19 b, c |  .12 (63%) | large |  .12 (63%) | large | Large difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .07 g | .19 | .21 h |  .12 (63%) | large |  .14 (74%) | large | Large difference  |
| - Contextualized | .07 g | .19 | .20 c |  .12 (63%) | large |  .13 (68%) | large | Large difference |
| - Non-journal articles | .10 e | .12 | .18 h |  .02 (17%) | negligible |  .08 (67%) | large | Negligible to large difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .08 e | .11 | .19 h |  .03 (27%) | moderate |  .11 (100%) | large | Moderate to large difference |
| - Contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| Purpose |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - General purpose | .08 f | .14 | .20 h |  .06 (43%) | large |  .12 (86%) | large | Large difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .11 d, e | .14 | .15 c |  .03 (21%) | moderate |  .04 (71%) | large | Moderate to large difference |
| - Contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| - Workplace purpose | .16 g | .19 | .20 c |  .03 (16%) | negligible |  .04 (21%) | moderate | Negligible to moderate difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .09 g | .19 | .20 c |  .10 (53%) | large |  .11 (58%) | large | Large difference |
| - Contextualized | .19 c, d, e, f | .20 | .21 c |  .01 (5%) | negligible |  .02 (10%) | negligible | Negligible difference |
| Sample |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Incumbents | .11 f | .16 | .19 h |  .05 (31%) | moderate |  .08 (50%) | large | Moderate to large difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .09 f | .15 | .20 h |  .06 (40%) | large |  .11 (73%) | large | Large difference |
| - Contextualized | .11 g | .19 | .20 c |  .08 (42%) | large |  .09 (47%) | large | Large difference  |
| - Applicants | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| - Non-contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| - Contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| Design |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - Concurrent design | .11 f  | .15 | .19 h |  .04 (27%) | moderate |  .05 (31%) | moderate | Moderate difference |
| - Non-contextualized | .09 f | .15 | .20 h |  .06 (40%) | large |  .06 (40%) | large | Large difference |
| - Contextualized | .11 g | .18 | .19 c |  .07 (39%) | moderate |  .08 (44%) | large | Moderate to large difference |
| - Predictive design | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| - Non-contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| - Contextualized | *Distribution is too small to reach definite conclusions regarding the robustness of the meta-analytic mean estimate* |
| Scale |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| - NEO | .08 f, g | .14 | .19 h |  .06 (43%) | large |  .11 (79%) | large | Large difference |
| - PCI | .20 d | .24 | .25 c |  .04 (17%) | negligible |  .05 (21%) | moderate | Negligible to moderate difference |
| - PSI | .21 e, f | .22 | .22 b, c, d |  .01 (5%) | negligible |  .01 (5%) | negligible | Negligible difference |

*Note:* Lowest value = lowest mean estimate from all analyses ($\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$; osr, $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{FE}}$, t&f $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, smm $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, sms $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, PET-PEESE, and *p*-uniform); $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$ = random-effects weighted mean observed correlation (the potentially best mean estimate); Highest value = highest mean estimate from all analyses ($\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$; osr, $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{FE}}$, t&f $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, smm $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, sms $\overbar{r}\_{o}$, PET-PEESE, and *p*-uniform); BRE = Baseline range estimate: the absolute range between $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$ and the estimate farthest away (either the lowest or highest value); MRE = Maximum range estimate: the absolute range between the lowest or highest value. When calculating the relative difference of the range estimates, we used $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$, the potentially best mean estimate, as the base (i.e., as 100%). Ideally, BRE and MRE should be identical. If not, outliers or other artifacts may have caused such differences. Practical difference: negligible = if the relative range (BRE or MRE) is smaller than 20%; moderate = if the relative range (BRE or MRE) is larger than 20%; large = if the relative range (BRE or MRE) is larger than 40% (Kepes et al., 2012).

a  Conclusions of a negligible difference indicate that the meta-analytic mean estimate (i.e., $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$) is likely to be robust. Conclusions of a moderate, moderate to large, or large difference indicates that the meta-analytic mean estimate (i.e., $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$) is likely to be non-robust and could be misestimated (i.e., $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$ could be under- or overestimated; typically overestimated in our analyses).

b = value from $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{RE}}$; c = value from osr, $\overbar{r}\_{o\_{FE}}$; d = value from t&f $\overbar{r}\_{o}$; e = value from smm $\overbar{r}\_{o}$; f = value from sms $\overbar{r}\_{o}$; g = value from PET-PEESE (value from PEESE if the PET value was significant, value from PET if it was not significant); h = value from *p*-uniform.